

Application No: 15/3863N

Location: Land Adjacent To The Bridge Inn, Broad Street, Crewe, Cheshire

Proposal: Proposed construction of 14 no. dwellings

Applicant: John Warters

Expiry Date: 23-Nov-2015

SUMMARY

The application site lies within the Crewe settlement boundary where Policy RES.4 of the Local Plan advises that new residential development in principle is accepted.

The proposal would bring positive planning benefits such as the provision of new dwellings in a sustainable location, the provision of an education contribution and the usual economic benefits created in the construction of new dwellings and the spending of the future occupiers in the local area.

The dis-benefits of the scheme include the impact upon ecology, flooding and drainage, amenity and the lack of tree information. It is considered that these impacts can be mitigated against by the use of planning conditions.

As such, the proposed application is recommended for approval.

RECOMMENDATION

APPROVE subject to S106 Agreement to secure a financial contribution towards education provision and conditions

REASON FOR DEFERRAL

The application was deferred by southern planning committee on the 3rd February 2016 for the following reasons;

- Defer for more information on HS2, Bin Stores, Better elevation plans in key plans pack

Further information concerning the 'Zone of Influence' of HS2 has been added to this report and further plans and elevations of the proposed dwellings have been marked up so they appear in the Committee Pack. These plans demonstrate the bin storage arrangements.

PROPOSAL

Full Planning permission is sought for the erection of 14 dwellings.

Revised plans have been received during the application process which now incorporate further openings and/or dummy openings within elevations highly visible within the streetscene.

SITE DESCRIPTION

The application site is a vacant plot of land to the south of Broad Street and to the east of the Bridge Inn Public House. The area is mainly characterised by two storey dwellings with dwellings fronting Lime Street to the west (the West Coast Main Line lies beyond these properties) with terraced properties fronting Crossway located to the east of the application site. The majority of the site currently lies overgrown and un-used with a smaller section of the land to the north of the site being used as a beer garden for the Bridge Inn. To the north-west corner of the site a small car-park provides parking for the Bridge Inn.

RELEVANT HISTORY

12/3877N - Extension to Time Limit on Planning Permission 10/0196N: Construction of Old Persons Residential Care Home Comprising 46 Single Bedrooms and 20 Independency Units, of 2 Storeys plus Attic Dormers – Approved 23rd November 2012

10/0196N - Construction of Old Persons Residential Care Home Comprising 46 Single Bedrooms and 20 Independency Units, of 2 Storeys plus Attic Dormers – Approved 21st April 2010

P07/1671 - External Seating Area – Approved 1st February 2008

P07/0983 - Rearrangement of Existing Car Park and Erection of 14 Residential Dwellings – Approved 12th October 2007

7/18209 – First-floor extension (15 Lime Street) – Approved 16th February 1990

7/17912 – First-floor extension (15 Lime Street) – Approved 16th February 1990

7/09510 – Alterations and extensions (15 Lime Street) – Approved 28th October 1982

NATIONAL & LOCAL POLICY

National Policy

The National Planning Policy Framework establishes a presumption in favour of sustainable development. Of particular relevance are paragraphs:

14 - Presumption in favour of sustainable development; 17 – Core planning principles, 47-50 - Wide choice of quality homes and 56-68 - Requiring good design

Development Plan

The Development Plan for this area is the Borough of Crewe and Nantwich Adopted Replacement Local Plan 2011.

The relevant Saved Policies are;

RES.2 - Unallocated Housing Sites, RES.3 - Housing Densities, BE.1 – Amenity, BE.2 - Design Standards, BE.3 - Access and Parking, BE.4 - Drainage, Utilities and Resources, BE.5 – Infrastructure and BE.6 - Development on Potentially Contaminated Land

Cheshire East Local Plan Strategy – Submission Version (CELP)

The following are considered relevant material considerations as indications of the emerging strategy:

SD1 (Sustainable Development in Cheshire East), SD2 (Sustainable Development Principles), SE1 (Design), SE2 (Efficient Use of Land), SE4 (The Landscape), SE5 (Trees, Hedgerows and Woodland), IN1 (Infrastructure) and IN2 (Developer Contributions)

CONSULTATIONS

Strategic Infrastructure Manager (SIM) – No objections, subject to conditions relating to; the prior submission of a construction method statement and that the approved access shall be constructed prior to commencement of development. In addition, an informative that the developer will enter into a Section 184 Agreement of the Highways Act 1980

Environmental Protection (Cheshire East Council) – No objections, subject to a number of conditions including; the prior submission of a piling method statement; the prior submission of a dust mitigation scheme; a restriction over the hours of construction; the provision of Electric Vehicle Charging point for each dwelling and the prior submission of a Phase II contaminated land report. In addition, informatives relating to hours of piling and contaminated land are also sought

Flood Risk Manager (Cheshire East Council) – No objections, subject to the provision of detailed hydraulic calculations that clearly identify agreed discharges and show how the 1 in 100 year plus climate volumes can be safely accommodated.

United Utilities – No objections, subject to the following conditions; that the development's foul and surface water shall be drained on a separate systems; the prior approval of a surface water drainage scheme

Public Rights of Way (Cheshire East Council) - No objections

Education (Cheshire East Council) – No objections, subject to a financial contribution of £32,538.87 towards primary school provision

Housing (Cheshire East Council) – No objections – No affordable housing requirement

Crewe Town Council – No comments received at time of report

REPRESENTATIONS

Letters were sent to the occupiers of the properties adjacent to the application site. In addition, a site notice was erected and the site was advertised in the local newspaper. In response, 3 neighbouring letters of objection / concern have been received. The main areas of concern raised include;

- Amenity – Loss of privacy, noise, air pollution
- Ecology – Loss of habitat
- Highway safety – Access arrangements
- Public footpath maintenance

APPRAISAL

The key issues are:

- The sustainability of the proposal (Economic, Social and Economic Role)
- Planning balance

Sustainability

The National Planning Policy Framework definition of sustainable development is:

“Sustainable means ensuring that better lives for ourselves don’t mean worse lives for future generations. Development means growth. We must accommodate the new ways by which we will earn our living in a competitive world. We must house a rising population, which is living longer and wants to make new choices. We must respond to the changes that new technologies offer us. Our lives, and the places in which we live them, can be better, but they will certainly be worse if things stagnate. Sustainable development is about change for the better, and not only in our built environment”

The NPPF determines that sustainable development includes three dimensions:- economic, social and environmental. These dimensions give rise to the need for the planning system to perform a number of roles:

an economic role – contributing to building a strong, responsive and competitive economy, by ensuring that sufficient land of the right type is available in the right places and at the right time to support growth and innovation; and by identifying and coordinating development requirements, including the provision of infrastructure;

a social role – supporting strong, vibrant and healthy communities, by providing the supply of housing required to meet the needs of present and future generations; and by creating a high quality built environment, with accessible local services that reflect the community’s needs and support its health, social and cultural well-being;

an environmental role – contributing to protecting and enhancing our natural, built and historic environment; and, as part of this, helping to improve biodiversity, use natural resources prudently, minimise waste and pollution, and mitigate and adapt to climate change including moving to a low carbon economy

These roles should not be undertaken in isolation, because they are mutually dependent.

Economic and Social Role

Principle of Development

Policy RES.2 of the Local Plan advises that within the settlement boundaries of Crewe and Nantwich, which are defined on the proposals map, the development or redevelopment of unallocated sites for housing will be permitted so long as it is in accordance with policies BE.1 to BE.5 of the Local Plan.

Housing Land Supply

Paragraph 47 of the National Planning Policy Framework requires that Council's identify and update annually a supply of specific deliverable sites sufficient to provide five years worth of housing against their housing requirements.

The calculation of Five Year Housing supply has two components – the housing requirement – and then the supply of housing sites that will help meet it. In the absence of an adopted Local Plan the National Planning Practice Guidance indicates that information provided in the latest full assessment of housing needs should be considered as the benchmark for the housing requirement.

Following the suspension of the Examination into the Local Plan Strategy and the Inspectors interim views that the previous objectively assessed need (OAN) was 'too low' further evidential work has now taken place and a fresh calculation made.

Taking account of the suggested rate of economic growth and following the methodology of the NPPG, the new calculation suggests that need for housing stands at 36,000 homes over the period 2010 – 2030. Although yet to be fully examined this equates to some 1800 dwellings per year.

The 5 year supply target would amount to 9,000 dwellings without the addition of any buffer or allowance for backlog. The scale of the shortfall at this level will reinforce the suggestion that the Council should employ a buffer of 20% in its calculations – to take account 'persistent under delivery' of housing plus an allowance for the backlog.

While the definitive methodology for buffers and backlog will be resolved via the development plan process this would amount to an identified deliverable supply of around 11,300 dwellings.

This total exceeds the total deliverable supply that the Council is currently able to identify – and accordingly it remains unable to demonstrate a 5 year supply of housing land.

This is a material consideration in support of the proposal.

As such the principle of housing within Crewe is accepted, subject to its adherence with other relevant Local Plan Policies. Furthermore, the provision of market housing is a social and economic benefit in principle given the Council's Housing Land Supply position.

Other economic considerations

It is accepted that the construction of a small housing development of this size would bring the usual economic benefit to the closest shops in Crewe for the duration of the construction, and would potentially provide local employment opportunities in construction and the wider economic benefits to the construction industry supply chain. There would be some economic and social benefit by virtue of new resident's spending money in the area and using local services.

As such, it is not considered that the proposed development would be economically sustainable.

Other social considerations

Affordable Housing

The Council's Housing Officer has reviewed the proposal and advised that the scale of the scheme does not trigger an affordable housing requirement.

Education

The Council's Education Officer has reviewed the proposal and considered the capacity of the closest primary and secondary schools.

It is advised that the development of 14 dwellings is expected to generate:

3 primary children (14 x 0.19)

2 secondary children (14 x 0.15)

The development is forecast to increase an existing shortfall predicted for 2016 and beyond, for primary provision in the immediate locality. To date, the development is forecast to be at no detriment to secondary provision.

To alleviate forecast pressures, the following contribution would be required:

$3 \times £11,919 \times 0.91 = £32,538.87$ (primary)

Total education contribution: £32,538.87

Subject to the provision of this sum, it is considered that the impact upon local education provision would be neutralised.

Residential Amenity

Policy BE.1 of the Local Plan advises that proposals for new development shall be permitted so long as the development does not prejudice the amenity of future occupiers or the occupiers of adjacent properties by reason of overshadowing, overlooking visual intrusion, noise and disturbance or in any other way.

With reference to the proposed layout plan, the closest residential properties to the proposed dwellings would be; No 175 and 179 Broad Street to the north, No's 55 – 45 Crossway to the east and No's 1 – 16 Lime Street to the east.

For the erection of new houses, the proposal would be expected to adhere to specified separation distances between the proposed new dwellings themselves and the surrounding properties.

The Council's '*Development on Back lands and Gardens Supplementary Planning Document.*' details these minimum standards. Paragraph 3.9 of the SPD advises that '*As a general indication, there should ideally be a distance of 21 metres between principal elevations* (e.g. between properties fronting and backing onto each other), *13.5 metres between a principal elevation with windows to habitable rooms and blank elevations* (e.g. the front and rear of dwellings and the side of other properties)...

To the north of the site, the closest properties would be Plots 1 and 3 to No's 175 and 179 Broad Street. The side/rear corner of No.175 Broad Street would be located approximately 11.5 metres from the rear/side corner of the dwelling on plot 1 and approximately 13.4 metres from the rear elevation of the dwelling proposed on Plot 3.

Separating these plots is a public footpath and double boundary treatment.

Given the offset relationship between this dwelling and plot 1, it is not considered that the occupiers of this neighbouring dwelling would be detrimentally impacted by the proposed development in terms of loss of privacy, light or visual intrusion.

As the separation distance between the side elevation of No.175 Broad Street and the rear elevation of Plot 3 largely adhere to the minimum separation standards, it is not considered that any significant amenity issues in relation to the above considerations would be created.

To the east, the side elevation of Plot 3 would be located approximately 15.5 metres from the rear elevation of No.55 Crossway, the dwelling proposed on plot 5 would be approximately 13.4 metres away from the rear elevation of No.52 Crossway, the rear elevations of Plots 6-8 would be between 20 and 23 metres away from the rear elevations of 50, 51 and 49 Crossway and the side elevation of plot 9 would be approximately 14.8 metres from the rear elevation of No.47 Crossway.

As such, all of these distances would largely adhere to the recommended separation standards listed in the SPD.

With regards to the impact upon the occupiers of the properties on Lime Street, the rear elevation of plot 14 would be approximately 20 metres from the main two-storey aspect of the rear elevation of No.2 Lime Street. A single-storey aspect would be approximately 17 metres away, but offset.

The rear elevation of plot 13 would be approximately 18 metres from the rear elevation of No.3 Lime Street, but the relationship would be offset.

Due to a combination of offset relationships and the close adherence to the recommended separation standards, it is not considered that the occupiers of the properties on Lime

Street would be significantly impacted with regards to loss of privacy, light or visual intrusion.

The properties on Broad Street lie within relatively close proximity to each other, including the front-to-front relationships at a distance short of the recommended standards. As such, there is scope for the application proposal to reflect this local character. Some of the relationships between the proposed dwellings are indeed short of the recommended separation standards. However, due to the character of the area and the relationship between the proposed dwellings, it is not considered that the proposal would create any significant amenity concerns for the future occupiers of the proposed dwellings.

With regards to environmental disturbance, the Council's Environmental Protection Officer has advised that they have no objections, subject to a number of conditions including; the prior submission of a piling method statement; the prior submission of a dust mitigation scheme; a restriction over the hours of construction; the provision of Electric Vehicle Charging point for each dwelling and the prior submission of a Phase II contaminated land report. In addition, informatives relating to hours of piling and contaminated land are also sought.

As such, subject to the inclusion of the proposed conditions, it is considered that the proposed development would adhere with Policy BE.1 of the Local Plan.

Environmental role

Design

Policy BE.2 of the Local Plan advises that new development should respect the pattern, character and form of the surroundings and not adversely affect the streetscene by reason of scale, height, proportions or materials used.

Policies SD2 and SE1 of the emerging Cheshire East Local Plan Strategy – Submission Version largely support this local plan policy.

The proposed layout plan shows the erection of 14 new dwellings. The existing wide access to the public house would be narrowed and be taken almost from the front of the pub onto Broad Street and would arc immediately to the east before extending south into and to the end of the site. All of the proposed new dwellings would front onto this new access road as this new access would also access to the remaining public house car park.

The scheme would comprise of 3 detached, two-storey dwellings (Plots 3-5), 4 semi-detached, 2 ½ storey properties (Plots 1 – 2 and 13 -14) and 7, 2 ½ story terraced properties (Plots 6-8 and 9-12).

2 off-street parking spaces are proposed for each dwelling.

Subject to the inclusion of a landscaping condition to ensure the provision of adequate soft landscaping, it is considered that the layout of the scheme would be acceptable.

Surrounding the application site, this part of Crewe comprises of a mixture of semi-detached and terraced 2-storey properties. There are also occasional detached properties not too far from the application site, namely 20 Lime Street and 159 Broad Street.

As such the mixed form of dwellings sought would not appear incongruous within the area and as such, would be acceptable.

With regards to scale, the proposed dwellings would range in height between 8 and 8.5 metres.

This range of heights, would largely respect the heights of the surrounding units.

The dwellings would be of a simple design that would comprise of exposed brickwork finishes, dual-pitched roofs, symmetrical openings and many of the units would include gable features that would respect the dual-pitched design of the dwellings sought.

Following negotiations with the applicant, further design features have been incorporated into many of the original exposed blank elevations.

It is considered that the design of the proposed development would adhere with Policy BE.2 of the Local Plan.

Highway Safety

The internal layout has been the subject of some discussion with the applicant and the Council's Road Adoption Engineer and it was determined that the Highway Authority would be unwilling to adopt the proposed layout; therefore, the applicant has agreed that the internal layout will not be adopted and will be managed and maintained privately.

It is noted that the development proposals will result in a small loss of off-street parking for The Bridge Inn, much of which is frontage parking along Broad Street; the use of which may involve vehicles being reversed into the highway. The SIM considered that the removal of this parking is beneficial from a highway safety perspective, furthermore, the parking loss was considered acceptable under the previous planning consents.

In terms of off-street parking provision, two spaces are provided for each three bedroom dwelling and three spaces are provided for the +4 bedroom dwellings. This level of provision is in accordance with CEC's minimum parking standards for residential dwellings.

Access to the site is taken from a new priority controlled junction with Broad Street;

In terms of junction geometry, layout and visibility the SIM has advised that access proposals are considered to be acceptable to serve a development of 14 dwellings and The Bridge Inn car park in this location.

A development of 14 dwellings would be expected to generate less than 10 two way trips during the morning and evening commuter peak periods; The SIM has advised that on this level of traffic generation, it is not expected that the development would have a material impact on the operation of the adjacent or wider highway network.

The SIM concludes that he is satisfied that the development proposals can be safely accommodated on the adjacent highway network; accordingly, the SIM has no objection to the planning application subject to conditions relating to; the prior submission of a construction method statement and that the approved access shall be constructed prior to

commencement of development. In addition, an informative that the developer will enter into a Section 184 Agreement of the Highways Act 1980

The development is therefore considered to adhere with Policy BE.3 of the Local Plan.

Nature Conservation / Ecology

The Council's Nature Conservation Officer reviewed the original proposal and advised that an Ecological Appraisal of the site was required to allow determination of the potential impacts of the proposed development on nature conservation & protected species.

This appraisal was received during the application process.

The Council's Nature Conservation Officer has reviewed this and advised that he is satisfied that the risk to protected species is small with the exception of breeding birds which could be using trees and scrub on site. It is recommended that a condition to protect the breeding birds is imposed.

Subject to this condition, it is considered that the proposal would adhere to Policy NE.2 of the Local Plan and Policy SE.3 of the emerging Cheshire East Local Plan Strategy - Submission Version.

Flood Risk and Drainage

The site does not lie within a flood zone and as such, flooding is not a primary consideration in this instance.

The Council's Flood Risk Officer has reviewed the proposal and advised that he has no objections on flooding grounds, but recommends a condition to seek the prior approval of detailed hydraulic calculations that clearly identify agreed discharges and show how the 1 in 100 year plus climate volumes can be safely accommodated.

United Utilities (UU) were consulted with regards to drainage. UU have subsequently advised that they have no objections to the scheme, subject to the following conditions; that the development's foul and surface water shall be drained on a separate systems; the prior approval of a surface water drainage scheme.

As such, subject to the addition of these conditions, it is considered that the proposed development would adhere with Policy BE.4 of the Local Plan.

Landscape and Trees

The site is located to the south of the Bridge Inn with residential development to the west and east. The site is mainly laid to unmaintained grass with areas of bramble and an overgrown hedge with some trees and damson self sets separating the site from a footpath to the rear of properties in Crossway. There are trees on adjoining land which overhang the site.

Trees

The submission does not provide an existing site survey and no arboricultural information is provided. In this respect the submission does not accord with BS 5837:2012 Trees in relation to design, demolition and construction guidelines and it is not possible to make an assessment of the arboricultural impacts.

In the absence of this information, no assessment as to whether existing trees would be impacted can be made. Therefore, it is considered that the proposal would be contrary to Policy NE.5 of the Local Plan.

Landscape

No issues are created given the urban location of the site.

Rail - HS2 Matters

The application site lies within approximately 25 metres from the railway line separated by Lime Street and a row of properties to the east.

Concerns were raised by Members with specific regards to the impact the development could have up HS2 proposals, and specifically that the site potentially lies with the 'zone of influence'.

The HS2 Safeguarding Planning Manager in London has been contacted in this regard. In response, the Safeguarding Manager advised that the sphere of influence is not a term HS2 Ltd uses and advised that *'...there is currently no statutory requirement for planning applications in this area to be referred to HS2 Ltd for comments.'*

The HS2 Manager subsequently advised that *'Whilst the site in question is in very close proximity to the proposed HS2 Phase two route, given the current stage of design and the on-going consideration of consultation responses for that section of railway, HS2 Ltd would not at this stage wish to make any specific comments on the proposed development...'*

On this basis, HS2 matters are not sustainable as a reason to refuse this application.

Environmental Conclusion

The proposed revised development would be of an acceptable design that would not create any significant issues in relation to highway safety, drainage / flooding or landscape subject to conditions.

However, as insufficient information has been provided to assess the impact of the proposed development upon trees.

As such, it is considered that the proposed development would be environmentally unsustainable.

Other Matters

The proposed development is not of a scale which requires an open space provision.

Planning Balance

The application site lies within the Crewe settlement boundary where Policy RES.4 of the Local Plan advises that new residential development in principle is accepted.

The proposal would bring positive planning benefits such as the provision of new dwellings in a sustainable location, the provision of an education contribution and the usual economic benefits created in the construction of new dwellings and the spending of the future occupiers in the local area.

The dis-benefits of the scheme, such as the impact upon ecology, flooding and drainage, amenity and the lack of tree information can be mitigated against by the use of planning conditions.

As such, the proposed application is recommended for approval.

RECOMMENDATION

APPROVE subject to a S106 Agreement to secure;

- 1. £32,538.87 towards education provision**

And conditions;

- 1. Time – 3 years**
- 2. Plans**
- 3. Materials – Prior approval**
- 4. Prior submission / approval of a Construction Method Statement**
- 5. The approved access shall be constructed prior to commencement of development**
- 6. The prior submission / approval of a piling method statement**
- 7. The prior submission / approval of a dust mitigation scheme**
- 8. Hours of construction**
- 9. The provision of Electric Vehicle Charging points**
- 10. The prior submission / approval of a Phase II contaminated land report**
- 11. The prior submission / approval of hydraulic calculations that clearly identify agreed discharges and show how the 1 in 100 year plus climate change volumes can safely be accommodated**
- 12. Foul and surface water shall be drained on a separate systems**
- 13. The prior approval of a surface water drainage scheme**
- 14. Prior submission / approval of Landscaping Scheme**
- 15. Landscaping – Implementation**
- 16. Prior approval of Boundary treatment**
- 17. Prior approval of Breeding Bird details**
- 18. Prior submission of a tree protection scheme**

In order to give proper effect to the Committee's intentions and without changing the substance of the decision, authority is delegated to the Planning Manager (Regulation) in consultation with the Chair (or in there absence the Vice Chair) of the Southern Planning Committee, to correct any technical slip or omission in the

wording of the resolution, between approval of the minutes and issue of the decision notice.

